State of New York

Court of Appeals

Decisions

May 23, 2024

CASES

No. 49
Nigel John Eccles, et al.,
Appellants,
v.

Shamrock Capital Advisors, LLC, et al., Respondents.

2 No. 58
The People &c.,
Respondent,
v.
Antwyne Lucas,
Appellant.

1 No. 47
In the Matter of Michele Rawlins,
Appellant,
V.
Teachers' Retirement System of the City of New York, et al.,
Respondents.

1 No. 57
The People &c.,
Respondent,
V.
Mark Watkins,
Appellant.

Order reversed, with costs, and so much of the order of Supreme Court, New York County, as denied defendants' motions to dismiss the complaint reinstated.

Opinion by Judge Singas. Chief Judge Wilson and Judges Rivera, Cannataro, Troutman, Reynolds Fitzgerald and Iannacci concur. Judges Garcia and Halligan took no part.

Order affirmed, in a memorandum. Chief Judge Wilson and Judges Garcia, Singas, Cannataro and Halligan concur. Judge Troutman concurs in result in an opinion, in which Judge Rivera concurs.

Order affirmed, with costs.
Opinion by Judge Cannataro.
Chief Judge Wilson and Judges Rivera, Garcia,
Singas, Troutman and Halligan concur.

Order affirmed.
Opinion by Judge Halligan.
Chief Judge Wilson and Judges Garcia, Singas and Cannataro concur, Chief Judge Wilson in a concurring opinion.
Judge Troutman dissents in an opinion, in which Judge Rivera concurs in a separate dissenting opinion.

MOTIONS

Appellant.

Mo. No. 2024-2 Motion for leave to appeal granted. In the Matter of the Claim of Frank Aungst, Respondent, v. Family Dollar et al., Appellants. Workers' Compensation Board, Respondent. Mo. No. 2024-118 Motion for leave to appeal denied. The People &c., Respondent, v. Cesar Avendano, Appellant. Mo. No. 2024-152 Motion for leave to appeal dismissed upon the ground that the order sought to be appealed from Barasch & McGarry, P.C., &c., does not finally determine the action within the Respondent, meaning of the Constitution. v. Edward L. Marcowitz, Appellant. Mo. No. 2024-107 Motion for leave to appeal denied. Motion for poor person relief dismissed as academic. The People &c., Respondent, v. Jamik Beard, Appellant. Mo. No. 2024-67 Motion for leave to appeal denied. The People &c., Respondent, v. Brian R. Bussom,

Mo. No. 2024-8 Kristine M. Carlson, Appellant, v. Crissy Colangelo, &c. et al., Respondents. Mo. No. 2024-127 1 The People &c., Respondent, v. Jose Castro, Appellant. Mo. No. 2024-186 1 Peter Chien. Appellant, v. James Fishman. Respondent. Mo. No. 2024-125 In the Matter of Peter J. Corines, Appellant, v. NYS Dept. of Education Office of Professions, Respondent. Mo. No. 2024-94 Alfredo Cruz,

Appellant,

Respondent.

v.

City of New York,

Motion for leave to appeal granted.

Motion for leave to appeal denied. Motion for poor person relief dismissed as academic.

Motion for reconsideration of this Court's corrected February 20, 2024 dismissal order denied.

Motion for leave to appeal dismissed upon the ground that the order sought to be appealed from does not finally determine the proceeding within the meaning of the Constitution.

Motion for poor person relief dismissed as academic.

Motion to dismiss appeal granted and appeal dismissed, with four hundred dollars costs and one hundred dollars costs of motion, upon the ground that the motion for leave to appeal made at the Appellate Division was untimely.

Mo. No. 2024-129 Motion for leave to appeal denied. In the Matter of Raiguan Falls, Appellant, v. Hyun Chin Kim, &c., Respondent. Mo. No. 2024-87 Motion for leave to appeal denied with one hundred dollars costs and necessary reproduction Steven Hammond, disbursements. Appellant, Equinox Holdings LLC, &c. et al., Defendants, Michael Alexander, Respondent. Mo. No. 2024-241 Motion for reargument of motion for leave to appeal denied. In the Matter of Hillside Park 168, LLC, Appellant, v. New York State Division of Housing and Community Renewal, Respondent. Mo. No. 2024-148 Motion for reargument of motion for leave to appeal denied. Samuel D. Isaly, Appellant, v. Damian Garde, Respondent, et al., Defendant. Mo. No. 2024-242 Motion for reargument of motion for leave to appeal In the Matter of Kings Park 8809, LLC, denied. Appellant, New York State Division of Housing and

Community Renewal, Respondent.

3 Mo. No. 2024-100
Edward Korn et al.,
Plaintiffs,
V.
Robert B. Korn,
Appellant,
Madge Rothenberg, &c., et al.,
Respondents.
Gregory Toczko,

Motion for leave to appeal dismissed upon the ground that the order sought to be appealed from does not finally determine the action within the meaning of the Constitution.

Respondent.

Motion, insofar as it seeks leave to appeal from the October 2022 Family Court order, dismissed upon the ground that it does not lie (*see* CPLR 5602 [a]); motion for leave to appeal otherwise dismissed upon the ground that the Appellate Division orders sought to be appealed from do not finally determine the proceeding within the meaning of the Constitution. Motion for poor person relief dismissed as academic.

4 Mo. No. 2024-70
The People &c.,
Respondent,
V.
Dwight Moss,
Appellant.

Motion for leave to appeal granted. Motion for poor person relief granted. Judge Troutman took no part.

4 Mo. No. 2024-105
The People &c.,
Respondent,
V.
John J. Motell, IV,
Appellant.

Motion for leave to appeal denied.

Appellant, v. New York State Division of Housing and Community Renewal, Respondent. Mo. No. 2024-79 Motion for leave to appeal denied. The People &c., Respondent, v. Joshua Ortiz, Appellant. 4 Mo. No. 2024-44 Motion for leave to appeal dismissed upon the ground that appellant is not a party aggrieved (see In the Matter of Brandon P., CPLR 5511). Respondent, Jennifer M.C., Appellant, Jason M.C., Respondent. Mo. No. 2024-161 Motion for reargument denied. Suzanne P., &c., Appellant, Joint Board of Directors of Erie-Wyoming County Soil Conservation District, &c., et al., Respondents. Mo. No. 2024-84 Motion for leave to appeal denied. Motion for poor person relief dismissed as academic. The People &c.,

denied.

Motion for reargument of motion for leave to appeal

Mo. No. 2024-240

In the Matter of One Ninety Sixth St, LLC,

Respondent,

Gregorio Pareja-Hidalgo, Appellant.

Mo. No. 2024-154 Motion for leave to appeal denied. The People &c., Respondent, v. George Philips, Appellant. 1 Mo. No. 2024-157 Motion for reargument denied. In the Matter of the Estate of Alan Gerald Prince, &c. David Marc Prince, Appellant, Roberto Machado, Respondent. Mo. No. 2024-89 Motion for leave to appeal denied. Motion for poor person relief dismissed as academic. The People &c., Respondent, v. Roberto Rivera, Appellant. Mo. No. 2024-76 Motion for leave to appeal denied. Salescare, Inc. et al., Appellants, SEIU 1199 National Benefits Fund et al., Respondents, et al., Defendants. Mo. No. 2024-77 Motion for leave to appeal denied. The People &c., Respondent, v. Wayne Shufelt,

Appellant.

1 Mo. No. 2024-150
The People &c.,
Respondent,
v.
Raymond Talavera,
Appellant.

2 Mo. No. 2024-120
The People &c.,
Respondent,
v.
Ali Tleis,
Appellant.

Motion, insofar as it seeks leave to appeal from that portion of the Appellate Division order that denied the motion to strike portions of the People's Appellate Division brief, dismissed upon the ground that such portion of the order does not finally determine the proceeding within the meaning of the Constitution; motion for leave to appeal otherwise denied.

Motion for leave to appeal denied. Motion for poor person relief dismissed as academic.