

**SUPREME COURT OF THE STATE OF NEW YORK**  
***Appellate Division, Fourth Judicial Department***

837

**KA 19-01906**

PRESENT: WHALEN, P.J., LINDLEY, MONTOUR, GREENWOOD, AND NOWAK, JJ.

---

THE PEOPLE OF THE STATE OF NEW YORK, RESPONDENT,

V

MEMORANDUM AND ORDER

BILAL DINGLE, DEFENDANT-APPELLANT.

---

JULIE CIANCA, PUBLIC DEFENDER, ROCHESTER (JAMES ECKERT OF COUNSEL),  
FOR DEFENDANT-APPELLANT.

SANDRA DOORLEY, DISTRICT ATTORNEY, ROCHESTER (SCOTT MYLES OF COUNSEL),  
FOR RESPONDENT.

---

Appeal from a judgment of the Supreme Court, Monroe County (Alex R. Renzi, J.), rendered August 14, 2019. The judgment convicted defendant, upon his plea of guilty, of criminal sale of a controlled substance in the third degree.

It is hereby ORDERED that the judgment so appealed from is unanimously affirmed.

Memorandum: Defendant appeals from a judgment convicting him, upon his guilty plea, of criminal sale of a controlled substance in the third degree (Penal Law § 220.39 [1]). We agree with defendant, and the People correctly concede, that his waiver of the right to appeal is invalid (*see People v Thomas*, 34 NY3d 545, 564-566 [2019], *cert denied* – US –, 140 S Ct 2634 [2020]). Contrary to defendant's contention, however, the sentence is not unduly harsh or severe.

Entered: November 17, 2023

Ann Dillon Flynn  
Clerk of the Court