Rael Automatic Sprinkler Co., Inc. v 20 TSQ GroundCo LLC

2024 NY Slip Op 32194(U)

June 28, 2024

Supreme Court, New York County

Docket Number: Index No. 160958/2020

Judge: Joel M. Cohen

Cases posted with a "30000" identifier, i.e., 2013 NY Slip Op 30001(U), are republished from various New York State and local government sources, including the New York State Unified Court System's eCourts Service.

This opinion is uncorrected and not selected for official publication.

160958/2020

06/18/2024

006

INDEX NO.

MOTION DATE

MOTION SEQ. NO.

DECISION + ORDER ON

MOTION

SUPREME COURT OF THE STATE OF NEW YORK COUNTY OF NEW YORK: COMMERCIAL DIVISION PART 03M

-----X

RAEL AUTOMATIC SPRINKLER COMPANY, INC.,

Plaintiff,

- V -

20 TSQ GROUNDCO LLC.CNY CONSTRUCTION 701 LLC, NATIXIS REAL ESTATE CAPITAL LLC, NATIXIS, NEW YORK BRANCH, NEW YORK TUBS, LLC, FACADE TECHNOLOGY, LLC, HARDER SERVICES, INC., SIGNATURE METAL AND MARBLE MAINTENANCE, LLC, TEXAS SCENIC COMPANY, INC., PENGUIN MAINTENANCE AND SERVICES, INC., SOLAR ELECTRIC SYSTEMS, INC., A.F. SUPPLY CORP., TREX COMMERCIAL PRODUCTS, INC., SAFWAY ATLANTIC, LLC, B.A.C.C. BUILDERS INC., LIF INDUSTRIES, LLC, CUMMING MANAGEMENT GROUP, INC., LIVINGSTON ELECTRICAL ASSOCIATES. INC.,PGS MILLWORK, INC.,TRANSCONTINENTAL CONTRACTING, INC., ARGOSY DESIGNS INC., AMERICAN INDUSTRIES CORP. OF NEW YORK. UNITED STATES INFORMATION SYSTEMS, INC., PLATT BYARD DOVELL WHITE ARCHITECTS L.L.P., ASPRO PLUMBING INC., DESIMONE CONSULTING ENGINEERING GROUP, LLC, CONSOLIDATED CARPET WORKROOM, LLC, BLONDIE'S TREEHOUSE INCORPORATED, PARAMOUNT PAINTING GROUP, LLC, DOOR AUTOMATION CORP., SMARTWOOD INTERNATIONAL LLC, E. FRIEDMAN ASSOCIATES, INC., INFINITE SAFETY, QUALITY, AND CONSTRUCTION MANAGEMENT INC., ULE GROUP CORP., TETRA TECH ENGINEERS ARCHITECTS & LANDSCAPE ARCHITECTS, P.C. D/B/A COSENTINI ASSOCIATES, D3 LED, LLC, NAVILLUS TILE, INC., FACADE MAINTENANCE SYSTEMS LLC, OTIS ELEVATOR COMPANY, R&S UNITED SERVICES, INC., JEROME ALUMINUM PRODUCTS CORP., MONTBLEAU & ASSOCIATES, INC., MARAGOS PAINTING LLC, NEXT STEP DESIGN, JANTILE INCORPORATED, JOHN DOE 1 THROUGH 10, 20 TSQ LESSEE LLC,701 SEVENTH PROPERTY OWNER LLC, THE WITKOFF GROUP, BURO HAPPOLD CONSULTING ENGINEERS, P.C., KINGS COUNTY WATERPROOFING CORP., SERVICE GLASS & STORE FRONT CO., INC., METAL SALES CO., INC., CORD CONTRACTING CO. INC.

Defendants.

160958/2020 RAEL AUTOMATIC SPRINKLER vs. 20 TSQ GROUNDCO LLC Motion No. 006

Page 1 of 5

1 of 5

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 06/28/2024

v
 - A

HON. JOEL M. COHEN:

The following e-filed documents, listed by NYSCEF document number (Motion 006) 370, 371, 372, 373, 374, 375, 376, 377, 378, 379, 380, 381, 382, 383, 384, 385, 386, 387, 388, 389, 390, 391, 392, 393, 394, 395, 396, 397, 398, 399, 400, 402, 403, 404, 405, 406, 407, 408, 409, 410, 413, 414, 415, 416, 417, 419, 427, 431, 432, 433, 434, 435, 436, 437, 438

Were read on this motion to

CANCEL LIS PENDENS

On June 18, 2024, Defendant 20 TSQ GroundCo, LLC ("GroundCo"), filed an order to show cause to cancel the Notices of Pendency filed by (1) CNY Construction 701 LLC ("CNY") (NYSCEF 350); (2) United States Information Systems, Inc. (NYSCEF 238); (3) R&S United Services, Inc. ("R&S") (NYSCEF 349); (4) Safway Atlantic LLC ("Safway") (NYSCEF 305); (5) Rael Automatic Sprinkler Co. ("Rael") (NYSCEF 4); and (6) B.A.C.C. Builders, Inc. ("BACC") (NYSCEF 257).

GroundCo asserted that the underlying liens had been discharged, and therefore the Notices of Pendency should be canceled (NYSCEF 371 ¶ 3). The Court signed the order to show cause on June 20, 2024 (NYSCEF 400).

CPLR 6501(a) provides that "[a] notice of pendency may be filed in any action in a court of the state . . . in which the judgment demanded would affect the title to, incumbrance of, or the possession, use or enjoyment of, real property[.]" Our courts deem this to be a "procedural prerequisite[]," and if an action fails to meet this prerequisite because there is no "direct relationship" between the title or possession of the land and the action, "the remedy was denied" (5303 Realty Corp. v O&Y Equity Corp., 64 NY2d 313, 321 [1984]). CPLR 6514(a) requires cancellation of a notice of pendency "if the action has been settled, discontinued or abated[.]" Furthermore, under CPLR 6515, "[i]n any action other than a foreclosure action . . . the court . . .

2 of 5

INDEX NO. 160958/2020

RECEIVED NYSCEF: 06/28/2024

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 439

may direct any county clerk to cancel a notice of pendency . . . if the moving party shall give an undertaking in an amount to be fixed by the court' in non-foreclosure actions.

Contractors and subcontractors "shall have a lien for the principal and interest, of the value, or the agreed price" of their services "from the time of filing a notice of such lien" (LIEN L. § 3). Discharge of a lien is addressed in Lien Law § 19(4), which provides in part that:

[a] lien other than a lien for labor performed or materials furnished for a public improvement specified in this article, may be discharged as follows:

. . .

(4) [e]ither before or after the beginning of an action by the owner or contractor executing a bond or undertaking in an amount equal to one hundred ten percent of such lien conditioned for the payment of any judgment which may be rendered against the property for the enforcement of the lien

Under Lien Law § 17, "[w]here a lien is discharged by deposit or order, a notice of pendency of action shall not be filed."

R&S and BACC¹ oppose the motion, chiefly because GroundCo has not bonded over the total amount of judgment *interest* which has accrued by virtue of their lien claims (NYSCEF 406 ¶ 19, 413 ¶ 6). However, the amount of the lien is determined "from the time of filing of the notice" of the lien (Lien L. § 3). GroundCo has shown that the liens are discharged as a matter of record (NYSCEF 380, 383, 386, 391, 392, 395, 398). No party has disputed that the bonds cover 110% of the amounts indicated in the lien notices, as re3quired by Lien Law § 19(4) (*see* NYSCEF 372-98). Therefore, the liens are discharged and the Notices of Pendency are properly

160958/2020 RAEL AUTOMATIC SPRINKLER vs. 20 TSQ GROUNDCO LLC Motion No. 006

Page 3 of 5

¹ Consolidated Carpet Workroom, LLC ("CCW") originally filed an opposition affidavit, but it was withdrawn (NYSCEF 417; 419).

canceled because and the action no longer "affect[s] the title to, incumbrance of, or the possession, use or enjoyment of, real property" (CPLR 6501[a]).²

Therefore, it is

ORDERED that GroundCo's motion to cancel the notices of pendency (MS 029) is **granted**; it is further

ORDERED that the above-referenced Notices of Pendency against the property designated as **Block 1000**, **Lot 1** on the Tax Map for the City of New York and more commonly known as 701 7th Avenue, New York, New York 10036, filed in the office of the Clerk of the County of New York, are hereby canceled of record, and the Clerk of the County of New York be and is hereby directed to make a note of cancellation on the margin of the records of the Notices of Pendency referring to this order, including:

Filing Date	NYSCEF Number	Filing Party	
January 22, 2024	350	CNY Construction 701 LLC	
February 16, 2022	238	United States Information Systems, Inc.	
January 13, 2023	305	Safway Atlantic LLC	
December 16, 2020	4	Rael Automatic Sprinkler Co.	
January 11, 2024	349	R&S United Services, Inc.	
March 28, 2022	257	B.A.C.C. Builders Inc.	

² Rael files a responsive affidavit, but does not oppose the relief sought in the motion. Rather, it requests that the caption be amended to include the Surety (NYSCEF 403). However, due to the expedited relief sought by GroundCo, the Court limits the scope of this decision to the cancelation of the Notices of Pendency. The Court will consider an amended caption upon an appropriate filing.

NYSCEF DOC. NO. 439 RECEIVED NYSCEF: 06/28/2024

This constitutes the Decision and Order of the Court.

6/28/2024	_			20240628272846 MCOHEND391222A56 A41	DE910FDEC9EC4D2719
DATE				JOEL M. COHEN,	J.S.C.
CHECK ONE:		CASE DISPOSED	х	NON-FINAL DISPOSITION	
	х	GRANTED DENIED		GRANTED IN PART	OTHER
APPLICATION:		SETTLE ORDER		SUBMIT ORDER	
CHECK IF APPROPRIATE:		INCLUDES TRANSFER/REASSIGN		FIDUCIARY APPOINTMENT	REFERENCE