## **State of New York**

# Court of Appeals

### **Decisions**

April 27, 2023

#### **CASES**

No. 23 3

Kevin Grady,

Appellant,

Chenango Valley Central School District et

al.,

Respondents.

No. 24 3

Joanne Secky, &c.,

Appellant,

New Paltz Central School District et al.,

Respondents.

No. 22

Daler Singh, &c., et al.,

Appellants,

City of New York, et al.,

Respondents.

Order reversed, with costs, and defendants' motion

for summary judgment denied.

Opinion by Judge Garcia.

Chief Judge Wilson and Judges Cannataro and

Troutman concur.

Judge Rivera concurs in result in an opinion.

Judge Singas dissents in an opinion.

Judge Halligan took no part.

Order affirmed, with costs.

Opinion by Judge Garcia.

Chief Judge Wilson and Judges Singas, Cannataro and Troutman concur, Judge Singas in a concurring

opinion.

Judge Rivera dissents in an opinion.

Judge Halligan took no part.

Order affirmed, with costs.

Opinion by Judge Cannataro.

Chief Judge Wilson and Judges Garcia, Singas and

Troutman concur.

Judges Rivera and Halligan took no part.

#### **MOTIONS**

Respondent,

Appellant.

John Capuano,

Mo. No. 2023-207 Motion for reargument of motion for leave to appeal Susan Aranoff, Judge Halligan took no part. Respondent, v. Gerald Aranoff, Appellant. Mo. No. 2023-69 1 Motion for leave to appeal denied. Judge Halligan took no part. In the Matter of the Estate of Minda S. Bikman, &c., Appellant, v. New York City Loft Board, et al., Respondents, et al., Respondent. 1 Mo. No. 2023-93 Motion for leave to appeal denied. Motion for poor person relief dismissed as academic. The People &c., Judge Halligan took no part. Respondent, v. Luis Bonnet, Appellant. Mo. No. 2023-74 Motion for leave to appeal dismissed upon the ground that the order sought to be appealed from Denise M. Buckley et al., does not finally determine the action within the Appellants, meaning of the Constitution. v. Judge Halligan took no part. Nicholas S. McAteer et al., Respondents. Mo. No. 2023-89 Motion for leave to appeal denied. Judge Halligan took no part. The People &c.,

Mo. No. 2023-68 Motion for leave to appeal denied. Motion for poor person relief dismissed as academic. The People &c., Judge Halligan took no part. Respondent, v. Victor Castillo, Appellant. 1 Mo. No. 2023-118 Motion for leave to appeal denied. Motion for poor person relief dismissed as academic. The People &c., Judge Halligan took no part. Respondent, v. Kevin Fuller, Appellant. Mo. No. 2023-85 Motion for leave to appeal dismissed upon the ground that the order sought to be appealed from In the Matter of the Claim of Nicole Gisser, does not finally determine the proceeding within the Respondent. meaning of the Constitution. iTutor.com, Inc., Judge Halligan took no part. Appellant. Commissioner of Labor, Respondent. Mo. No. 2023-132 Motion for leave to appeal granted. Judge Halligan took no part. John Golobe. Respondent, v. Ira Altchek, &c., Appellant. Mo. No. 2023-86

The People &c.,

v. Timothy Harnett,

Respondent,

Appellant.

Motion for leave to appeal denied.

Motion for poor person relief dismissed as academic.

Judge Halligan took no part.

Mo. No. 2023-72 Motion for leave to appeal denied. Motion for poor person relief dismissed as academic. The People &c., Judge Halligan took no part. Respondent, v. Dameon Harris, Appellant. 1 Mo. No. 2023-98 Motion for leave to appeal denied. Motion for poor person relief dismissed as academic. The People &c., Judge Halligan took no part. Respondent, v. Vonte Johnson, Appellant. Mo. No. 2023-96 Motion for leave to appeal denied with one hundred dollars costs and necessary reproduction Vikram Kuriyan, disbursements. Appellant, Judge Halligan took no part. v. Joel Schreiber et al., Respondents. Mo. No. 2023-116 Motion for leave to appeal denied. Judge Halligan took no part. The People &c., Respondent, v. Mark Lewis, Appellant. Mo. No. 2022-910 3 Motion for leave to appeal denied. Judge Halligan took no part. In the Matter of Long Island Pure Water, Ltd., Appellant, v.

New York State Department of Health, et al.,

Respondents.

3 Mo. No. 2023-39
In the Matter of Long Island Pure Water, Ltd.,
Appellant,
v.

New York State Department of Health, et al., Respondents.

2 Mo. No. 2023-75

Patricia A. McAteer, Respondent,

v.

Nicholas S. McAteer, Respondent. Denise M. Buckley et al.,

Nonparty-Appellants.

2 Mo. No. 2023-97

The People &c., Respondent,

V

Rafael Mizhquiri-Duarte, Appellant.

3 Mo. No. 2023-115

In the Matter of the Claim of John Molnar, Appellant,

v.

JRL South Hampton, LLC, et al., Respondents.

Workers' Compensation Board, Respondent.

2 Mo. No. 2023-70

In the Matter of Janet Monroe, &c., Respondent,

v.

Warren T.,

Appellant.

Motion by Chamber of Commerce of the United States of America for leave to appear amicus curiae on the motion for leave to appeal herein granted and the proposed brief is accepted as filed.

Judge Halligan took no part.

Motion for leave to appeal dismissed upon the ground that the order sought to be appealed from does not finally determine the action within the meaning of the Constitution.

Judge Halligan took no part.

Motion for leave to appeal denied. Judge Halligan took no part.

Motion for leave to appeal denied. Judge Halligan took no part.

Motion for leave to appeal dismissed upon the ground that appellant is not a party aggrieved (*see* CPLR 5511).

Judge Halligan took no part.

Reyes,
Respondent.
American Paraprofessional Systems of NYC, Inc.,
Appellant.
Commissioner of Labor,
Respondent.
(And Two Related Proceedings.)

Mo. No. 2023-109
The People &c.,
Respondent,
V.
Frank E. Ortiz,
Appellant.

Mo. No. 2023-82

Mo. No. 2023-138

In the Matter of the Claim of Andris Y. Mota

Motion, insofar as it seeks leave to appeal from that portion of the Appellate Division order affirming the decision of the Unemployment Insurance Appeal Board assessing appellant for additional unemployment insurance contributions, denied; motion for leave to appeal otherwise dismissed upon the ground that the remaining portions of the Appellate Division order do not finally determine the proceedings within the meaning of the Constitution. Judge Halligan took no part.

Motion for leave to appeal denied. Judge Halligan took no part.

Motion for leave to appeal denied. Judge Halligan took no part.

1 Mo. No. 2023-107 The People &c., Respondent, v. Edwin Rivera,

Appellant.

Farid Popal,

v.

Appellant,

Zachary Margulis-Ohnuma, Respondent.

2 Mo. No. 2023-123 Abdus Shahid, Appellant, V. City of New York, Respondent. Motion for leave to appeal denied. Motion for poor person relief dismissed as academic. Judge Halligan took no part.

Motion for reargument of motion for leave to appeal denied.
Judge Halligan took no part.

1 Mo. No. 2023-117

The People &c.,

Respondent,

v.

Pedro Torres,

Appellant.

Motion for leave to appeal denied. Motion for poor person relief dismissed as academic. Judge Halligan took no part.

1 Mo. No. 2023-83

Uchenna Ugo-Alum et al.,

Appellants,

v.

New York State Department of Motor Vehicles,

Respondent.

Motion for leave to appeal denied. Judge Halligan took no part.

2 Mo. No. 2023-67

Timothy Wall,

Appellant,

v.

Starbucks Corporation, Respondent.

Motion for leave to appeal denied. Judge Halligan took no part.

4 Mo. No. 2023-102 In the Matter of Williamsville Residents Opposed to Blocher Redevelopment, LLC, et al.,

Appellants,

v.

Village of Williamsville Planning and Architectural Review Board, et al., Respondents. Motion for leave to appeal denied with one hundred dollars costs and necessary reproduction disbursements.

Judge Halligan took no part.